

October 8, 2011

Sample Text #1:

“...Localized Economies”

What we valued	What we didn't value
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Trying to engage critically with McKibben's argument• Organized according to the student-writer's ideas• Student's idealism being sparked by reading McKibben's• Fascinating, inspiring, effective—student's point of view• Word choice: debunking, pretentious, narcissistic• Using words like argue, recognizes, proves: tells the reader what the student pulled from the author• Author is clear about the author, title, and purpose of the book being discussed• Attributed material to the author appropriately• Examples drawn from the text were a good fit with the student-writer's points; succinct enough that they could make the point in their own words• Quotations are chosen well and effectively contextualized• Student appears to have read most of the text (quoted from and referred to a range of pages)• Sentences make sense; technically accurate• Analysis: pg. 3, student making	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Don't see analysis of McKibben's rhetorical strategies; no dis-assembly of the text; eloquent summary• Nothing beyond "I agree with McKibben."• Students mix together summary and reflection/analysis• Didn't know what "hyper-individualism" was; reader was left guessing• Wanders; discussion doesn't back up thesis; couldn't tell where it was going until the end• Employs a 5-paragraph form; doesn't get beyond technique to dynamic play between form and content• Paragraph 2 was too darn long

<p>meaning of the text: analyzing what was and wasn't said</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I feel a great deal smarter having read the student's text • Using the vocabulary of analysis: the author's claim, rhetorical situation, author's intention, audience, proof, support* • Students show that they have ideas of their own* • Distinguish summary from response; report in a way the author would approve • Clear definition of key terms* • Be specific in your analysis; don't just summarize your analysis; if you refer to a group, identify who it is • Student is proficient with language: sentences, words, phrases 	
--	--

Sample Text #2: "Literacy..."

What we valued	What we didn't value
•	•